



**Appendix D** Section 1a:  
UCD Ballsbridge to City  
Centre Section -  
Fitzwilliam Street  
Lower Route Options  
Assessment MCA Table

Table D.1: Fitzwilliam Street MCA

Appraisal Criteria	Sub-Criteria	Option FS1 (Full Cross-Section - continuation of EPR Option)	Option FS2 (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	Option FS3 (Cycling in Bus Lane - retain parking on one side)	Option FS4 (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)
1 Economy	1A Capital Cost	<p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Moderate roadway realignment and site clearance along the length of the section</li> <li>- Construction of new cycle lanes</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>0 sqm Private Land</p> <p>0 Properties affected</p>	<p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Moderate roadway realignment and site clearance along the length of the section</li> <li>- Construction of new cycle lanes and parking bays</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>0 sqm Private Land</p> <p>0 Properties affected</p>	<p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Moderate roadway realignment and site clearance along the length of the section</li> <li>- Construction of parking bays</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>0 sqm Private Land</p> <p>0 Properties affected</p>	<p><i>Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Costs</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Moderate roadway realignment and site clearance along the length of the section</li> <li>- Construction of new cycle lanes and parking bays</li> </ul> <p><i>Land Acquisition Cost</i></p> <p>0 sqm Private Land</p> <p>0 Properties affected</p>
	Rank				
	1B Transport Quality & Reliability	<p>Journey Time Inbound: 18s Journey Time Outbound: 18s Length: 0.150 km No. of Junctions: 0 No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 0</p> <p>Full physical bus priority in both directions.</p>	<p>Journey Time Inbound: 23s Journey Time Outbound: 23s Length: 0.150 km No. of Junctions: 0 No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 0</p> <p>Bus priority provided by bus gate.</p>	<p>Journey Time Inbound: 33s Journey Time Outbound: 33s Length: 0.150 km No. of Junctions: 0 No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 0</p> <p>Reduced bus priority despite bus lanes in both directions due to likelihood of cyclist cycling in bus lanes.</p>	<p>Journey Time Inbound: 28s Journey Time Outbound: 28s Length: 0.150 km No. of Junctions: 0 No. of Pedestrian Crossings: 0</p> <p>Full physical bus priority provided in bus lanes. Bus priority provided by the signal-controlled bus priority where there are no bus lanes.</p>
Rank					

Appraisal Criteria	Sub-Criteria	Option FS1 (Full Cross-Section - continuation of EPR Option)	Option FS2 (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	Option FS3 (Cycling in Bus Lane - retain parking on one side)	Option FS4 (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)
2 Integration	2A Land Use Policy	Integrates with existing / planned residential, educational, medical and leisure uses in this established area.	Integrates with existing / planned residential, educational, medical and leisure uses in this established area.	Integrates with existing / planned residential, educational, medical and leisure uses in this established area.	Integrates with existing / planned residential, educational, medical and leisure uses in this established area.
	Rank				
	2B Residential Population and Employment Catchments	Similar Catchment for all route options.	Similar Catchment for all route options.	Similar Catchment for all route options.	Similar Catchment for all route options.
	Rank				
	2C Transport Network Integration	Similar potential along all route options.	Similar potential along all route options.	Similar potential along all route options.	Similar potential along all route options.
	Rank				
	2D Cycle Network integration	High quality Cycle facilities provided along Secondary Route C7 in the GDA Cycle network plan.	High quality Cycle facilities provided along Secondary Route C7 in the GDA Cycle network plan.	Non-segregated Cycle facilities provided along Secondary Route C7 in the GDA Cycle network plan due to cycling in the bus lane.	High quality Cycle facilities provided along Secondary Route C7 in the GDA Cycle network plan.
	Rank				

Appraisal Criteria	Sub-Criteria	Option FS1 (Full Cross-Section - continuation of EPR Option)	Option FS2 (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	Option FS3 (Cycling in Bus Lane - retain parking on one side)	Option FS4 (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)
	<b>2E Traffic Network Integration</b>	No restrictions to general traffic.  Removal of all parking likely to result in restricted vehicular access to properties and as such impacts traffic accessibility.	In-bound through traffic diverted via Herbert Street and Mount Street Upper.  Outbound through traffic diverted via Mount Street Upper and Herbert Lane.  Removal of some parking likely to result in restricted vehicular access to properties and as such impacts traffic accessibility however to a lesser extent than other options.	No restrictions to general traffic.  Removal of majority of parking likely to result in restricted vehicular access to properties and as such impacts traffic accessibility.	No diversions for general traffic. Delays due to bus priority traffic signalling and reduced queuing capacity.  Removal of majority of parking likely to result in restricted vehicular access to properties and as such impacts traffic accessibility.
	<b>Rank</b>				
<b>3 Accessibility &amp; Social Inclusion</b>	<b>3A Key Trip Attractors</b>	All routes service the same trip attractors.	All routes service the same trip attractors.	All routes service the same trip attractors.	All routes service the same trip attractors.
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>3B Deprived Geographic Areas</b>	All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All routes serve areas of the same means from the Pobal Deprivation Index.
	<b>Rank</b>				
<b>4 Safety</b>	<b>4A Road Safety</b>	No. of junctions: 0 No turn movements required.	No. of junctions: 0 No turn movements required.	No. of junctions: 0 No turn movements required.	No. of junctions: 0 No turn movements required.
	<b>Rank</b>				

<b>Appraisal Criteria</b>	<b>Sub-Criteria</b>	<b>Option FS1</b> (Full Cross-Section - continuation of EPR Option)	<b>Option FS2</b> (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	<b>Option FS3</b> (Cycling in Bus Lane - retain parking on one side)	<b>Option FS4</b> (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)
	<b>4B Pedestrian Safety</b>	Footpaths provided throughout. Signalised crossings at all major junctions.	Footpaths provided throughout. Signalised crossings at all major junctions.	Footpaths provided throughout. Signalised crossings at all major junctions.	Footpaths provided throughout. Signalised crossings at all major junctions.
	<b>Rank</b>				
<b>5 Environment</b>	<b>5A Archaeology &amp; Cultural Heritage</b>	No impact to recorded monuments within the study area.	No impact to recorded monuments within the study area.	No impact to recorded monuments within the study area.	No impact to recorded monuments within the study area.
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>5B Architectural Heritage</b>	No impact on protected structures.	No impact on protected structures.	No impact on protected structures.	No impact on protected structures.
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>5C Flora &amp; Fauna</b>	Requires the removal of 0 trees in public areas and 0 trees in private areas.  Total trees impacted: 0	Requires the removal of 0 trees in public areas and 0 trees in private areas.  Total trees impacted: 0	Requires the removal of 0 trees in public areas and 0 trees in private areas.  Total trees impacted: 0	Requires the removal of 0 trees in public areas and 0 trees in private areas.  Total trees impacted: 0
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>5D Soils, Geology &amp; Hydrology</b>	No appreciable impact	No appreciable impact	No appreciable impact	No appreciable impact
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>5E Landscape &amp; Visual</b>	This option involves no loss of trees and no impact to existing properties.	This option involves no loss of trees and no impact to existing properties.	This option involves no loss of trees and no impact to existing properties.	This option involves no loss of trees and no impact to existing properties.
<b>Rank</b>					

Appraisal Criteria	Sub-Criteria	Option FS1 (Full Cross-Section - continuation of EPR Option)	Option FS2 (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	Option FS3 (Cycling in Bus Lane - retain parking on one side)	Option FS4 (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)
	<b>5F Air Quality</b>	Potential impact on air quality due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the full length of this section of Fitzwilliam Street and retention of both general traffic lanes.	Potential positive impact on air quality due to only two lanes being provided over the section, and reduction in through traffic.	Potential impact on air quality due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the full length of this section of Fitzwilliam Street and retention of both general traffic lanes.	Potential impact on air quality due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the majority of this section of Fitzwilliam Street and retention of both general traffic lanes.
	<b>Rank</b>				
	<b>5G Noise &amp; Vibration</b>	Potential impact on noise and vibration due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the full length of this section of Fitzwilliam Street and retention of both general traffic lanes.  Proximity of road edge to properties is decreased compared to existing on both sides of the road over the majority of the section due to introduction of cycle lanes.	Potential positive impact on noise and vibration due to only two lanes being provided over the section, and reduction in through traffic.  Proximity of road edge to properties is decreased significantly compared to existing on both sides of the road over the majority of the section.	Potential impact on noise and vibration due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the full length of this section of Fitzwilliam Street and retention of both general traffic lanes.  Proximity of road edge to properties is decreased compared to existing on both sides of the road over the majority.	Potential impact on noise and vibration due to the introduction of two bus lanes over the majority of this section of Fitzwilliam Street and retention of both general traffic lanes.  Proximity of road edge to properties is decreased significantly compared to existing on both sides of the road over the majority of the section.
	<b>Rank</b>				

Appraisal Criteria	Sub-Criteria	Option FS1 (Full Cross-Section - continuation of EPR Option)	Option FS2 (2-lanes with Bus Gate)	Option FS3 (Cycling in Bus Lane - retain parking on one side)	Option FS4 (3-lanes with partial bus lanes and signal controlled priority)
	<b>5H Land Use Character</b>	<p>This option involves no loss of trees and no impact to existing properties.</p> <p>This option results in the loss of all existing on-street parking along the section.</p>	<p>This option involves no loss of trees and no impact to existing properties.</p> <p>This option retains on street parking on both sides of the road, however, is a reduction on existing.</p>	<p>This option involves no loss of trees and no impact to existing properties.</p> <p>This option retains on street parking on one side of the road, however, is a reduction on existing.</p>	<p>This option involves no loss of trees and no impact to existing properties.</p> <p>This option retains on street parking over the full section on alternating sides of the road, however, is a reduction on existing.</p>
	<b>Rank</b>				